INFORMATION ON APEX WIND PROJECT:

Prepared by Michael G. Parker, President, Oxford Township Board of Trustees

12/22/2018: Revision 1 - see asterisk 12/28/2018

This paper is for information only and is not intended to be a position paper either for or against electric power generating windmills as proposed by APEX Wind Turbines, Emerson Creek Wind Project. Portions of this paper were previously published in the Township's newsletter, Oxford Messenger, 2018 Fall Edition.

From the 2018 Fall Edition of Oxford Messenger

A representative of APEX Clean Energy came to the Trustee Meeting October 4th and advised Trustees of the following in the first two paragraphs below:

The Emerson Creek Wind Project is in final stages of the permitting process and preparing a permit for review and approval by the Ohio Power Siting Board. Plans are for ten 4.2 Megawatt electric (MWe) wind turbines to be placed in Oxford Township for a total of 42 MWe, all south of the turnpike and fourteen 4.2 MWe turbines in Groton Township. Each Turbine stands from ground level approximately 308 ft. tall to the generator and about 450 to 500 ft. tall to the tip of the blade (depending on type of blade installed). Power lines are mostly underground. Construction is expected to begin in 2020. He also advised us of 1000-1500 acres in Groton Township that APEX has also signed a lease for proposed installation of a solar farm.

The representative also discussed a proposed PILOT (Payment In Lieu Of Taxes) agreement with Trustees. The PILOT would annually pay for 30 years approximately \$9,000 per MWe with typically \$1,000 to the county, \$2,000 to the township and \$6,000 to the school district. The agreement would also include Fire and EMS training, funds for additional Fire and EMS equipment, a RUMA with the County Engineer and a local college energy education program for students to enter the energy industry. The PILOT should be beneficial to the schools as the funds are considered extra income, not taxes and the state will not withdraw funding from the school as they would with taxes. If a PILOT is not accepted, the project will be taxed, there will be no funds for college education, Fire, EMS etc. as in the PILOT agreement.

The representatives left and the Trustees discussed the following:

It is worthy of note for comparison that the Davis-Besse Cooling tower, that most of us are familiar with as a landmark, is 492 ft. tall. Ten 500 ft. tall turbines installed in Oxford Township south of the Turnpike would be a high density installation. Township Zoning requirements are superseded by State Law and the Ohio Power Siting Board has jurisdiction for permitting. The Ohio State setback requirements from adjoining property may be inadequate and adversely impact adjoining property owners and property values. All township property values could be adversely impacted. Development of property will be limited by installation of wind turbines. Some leases for the wind farm were signed many years ago and have been passed on to successive landowners. Trustees will need to consult with other county and township officials before deciding on whether to sign any agreement to insure we get the best deal for the Township, County and School Districts.

Update since the Fall Edition of Oxford Messenger was published.

Trustees have researched the proposed PILOT program and determined through this research that the Erie County Commissioners have the authority to enter into a PILOT program with APEX if they so desire. The Trustees can provide input for that decision, but have no legal authority to enter into any such agreement. Final decision as to the implementation of the project, with or without a PILOT agreement rests solely with the Ohio Power Siting Board. Since the fall edition was published, one or more representatives of APEX have attended the Township's Trustee meetings and have requested the trustees to sign a letter to Erie County Commissioners in support of a PILOT Program. They advised us that Margaretta Local School District officials have signed such a letter. The Trustees have not signed a letter to the Commissioners in support of a PILOT agreement, but Mr. Leber and Mr. Stewart did state in the December 6 meeting that they thought the PILOT was the better option if the windmill project was to proceed. Mr. Parker abstained from support as he is employed in the nuclear power industry, but did say he would not consider any decision by the Commissioners for a PILOT unfavorably. We have not seen any legal requirement for us to sign any letter for supporting a PILOT in order to receive such payments.

The representatives of APEX also advised us of the following:

- The permit was submitted to the Ohio Power Siting Board for review.*
- A public meeting was held in Bronson Conservation League by APEX as part of the process.
- The wind project now has 6 windmills planned for Oxford vs. the original 10, and 10 for Groton vs. the original 14.
- The wind mill height to blade tip had increased to 600 ft.

We have also learned via public meeting at Groton Twp. December 13 that the windmill height to blade tip is now 655 feet, professed to be the largest installed blade tip height in the U.S.

<u>In conclusion</u>, as of this writing, the Trustees have no legal jurisdiction in the approval of installation of the project. Any presentation or opinion,

for or against the project made by Trustees during Ohio Power Siting Board hearings requires the presence of legal representation and is subject to cross examination. Trustees can express their opinion to the Board of Erie County Commissioner for or against a PILOT. The Board of County Commissioners, in accordance with Ohio Senate Bill 232 can: 1. pass a resolution to make Erie Co. an Alternative Energy Zone that would automatically approve all PILOT applicable projects in the county, 2. Make a determination on each individual PILOT application, 3. Decline to participate in a PILOT or, 4. Do nothing which is the same as declining.

According to the proposal a PILOT with 6-4.2 MWe wind turbines in Oxford Twp. would generate approximately 6 turbines x 4.2 MWe x \$2000 = \$50,400. The school districts would collect approx. 3 times that amount or roughly \$ 150,000. Conversely, without the proposal, initial revenue could be as much as 4 times greater (\$200,000 for Oxford) the first year and subject to depreciation over the life of the project. The other incentives of PILOT noted in the newsletter would not apply.

*Correction -At the Dec. 27 Trustee meeting we were told that the Permit Application will be submitted about 15 January 2019.